

إمكانية تطبيق تصنيف بيكر لاستراتيجيات الترجمة على الخطاب العربي السري

The Applicability of Baker's Taxonomy of Translation Strategies on Arabic Narrative Discourse

Dr. Kawkab Salim Mohammed
University of Al-Hamdaniya-
College of Education

د. كوكب سالم محمد
جامعة الحمدانية- كلية التربية

kawkab_salim@uohamdaniya.edu.iq

الكلمات المفتاحية: مكافئ الترجمة، عدم وجود المكافئ الترجمة، استراتيجيات الترجمة، تصنيف بيكر، الخطاب العربي السري

Keywords: Equivalence, non-equivalence, translation strategies, Baker taxonomy, Arabic narrative discourse

المستخلص

قد لا يتأتى التواصل بين الثقافات بشماره بشكل فعال خاصة عندما نكون بصدد الترجمة للخطاب العربي الأدبي. ولقد أهتم المتخصصين والمترجمين المحترفين بآليه التغلب على المعوقات المتعلقة بإيجاد المكافئ الترجمة وتم اقتراح استراتيجيات ترجمة مختلفة من قبل باحثي الترجمة. تهدف هذه الدراسة إلى معرفة مدى قابلية تطبيق تصنيف بيكر لاستراتيجيات الترجمة التي يستخدمها المترجمون عند ترجمة الخطاب السري العربي. حيث تنظر بيكر (1992) الى المكافئ الترجمة على أنه هرمي ، أي انه يتدرج من مستوى الكلمة وما فوق مستوى الكلمة. ومن خلال تحليل مجموعة مقتطفات مأخوذة من ثلاث روايات للكاتب المصري نجيب محفوظ وترجماتها المنشورة باللغة الإنجليزية تبين أن تصنيف استراتيجيات الترجمة الذي اقترحه بيكر يضم مجموعة استراتيجيات مناسبة بغية التعامل مع مشكلة عدم وجود المكافئ الترجمة.

Abstract

Cross cultural communication doesn't always bring its fruits effectively especially when dealing with literary Arabic discourse. The difficulties associated with finding the appropriate equivalence have been widely commented on by scholars and professional translators. Various translation strategies have been proposed by the translation researchers. This study aims to find out the applicability of Baker's taxonomy of the translation strategies used by translators in translating Arabic narrative discourse. Baker (1992) views equivalence as hierarchical, i.e., to cover the word level and above word level. The study deals with analyzing a set of extracts taken from three of Naguib Mahfouz's novels and their realizations in English. It is found that Baker's translation strategy taxonomy provides appropriate set of strategies to deal with non-equivalence problem.

1. Introduction:

Since translation is an inter-cultural communication between different cultures, difficulties are inescapable. These challenges in translation have been broadly focused on by translation theorists and translators. To overcome the difficulties emerging from translating texts, various translation strategies have been proposed by the theorists of translation. This study aims to find out the pertinence of Baker's taxonomy of the translation strategies used by translators in translating Arabic narrative discourse. Mona Baker (1992) analyzes the term equivalence at both word level and above the word level, including "grammatical equivalence", "textual equivalence" and "pragmatic equivalence", which means that "equivalence" is hierarchical. However, in translating a text, a translator may find a problematic word which is hard to translate since it has no exact or appropriate equivalence in the target language. This is a case of non-equivalence at word level.

In translating Arabic narrative discourse, cultural differences stem as the main problem, as Nida puts it, since "differences between cultures may cause more severe complications for the translator than do differences in language structure" (Nida, 1964:130). In this way, translators are to be bicultural and bilinguals since literature is not the production of form and content but it carries the cultural atmosphere of that language (Bassnett and Lefevere (1998:11)

With respect to the non-equivalence problem at the word level, Baker (1992) highlighted some strategies that professional translators have utilized in translation.

2. Objectives of the Study:

The pertinence of Baker's taxonomy of translation strategies on three novels by Naguib Mahfouz -which are translated by different translators- is intended to provide an understanding that the problem of

translation equivalence is not simply of linguistic relativity; rather, it depends on how the ST is understood and reproduced by the translators.

3. Research Questions:

The study is designed to produce an answer for the following questions:

1-To what extent Baker's taxonomy are applicable to the translation of literary discourse in general, and Arabic narrative discourse in specific to overcome the non-equivalence problem.

2-To what extent does the choice of applying these strategies has helped the translators to reproduce the flavor of the ST to the TT?

4. Data Collection and Research Methodology:

The data of the analysis in this study are taken from three novels by Naguib Mahfouz and their English published translations. These novels are "Zuqaq Al-Midaq", "The Thief and the dogs" and "Miramar". We adopted Baker's (1992) taxonomy of translation strategies as the theoretical framework to deal with problem of equivalence.

5-Data Analysis and Discussion:

In this section, Baker's (1992:26-42) eight strategies, which have been used by professional translators, are to be focused on to test the applicability of these translation strategies followed by the translators when translating the three novels. The researcher gives back translation for each text to examine how far the TT is from the ST. These strategies are examined as below:

1. "Translation by a more general word (superordinate)":

This is a very common strategy being used in non-equivalence cases. According to Baker (1992), this strategy is workable in most languages, because the hierarchical structure of semantic fields is not language-specific. Let's consider the following example with some illustrated discussion:

The Arabic Text:

١- "ثم تناول الريابة يجرب أوتارها." (محفوظ، زقاق المدق، ١٩٧٣ : ٩)

٢- "يتحدث الناس عنك كأنك عنقرة" (محفوظ، اللص والكلاب، ١٩٦١ : ٩١)

The English Translation:

- "He picked up his instrument and began to pluck its strings."

(Mahfouz, Midaq Alley, 1992:8)

- "People are talking about you as if you were some **storybook hero**"

(Mahfouz, The Thief and the Dogs, 1984:115)

Back Translation:

- وتناول آله وبدأ يسحب خيوطها.

- يتحدث الناس عنك كأنك بطل قصة.

Van leeuwen (2004:19) admits that translation can never produce the full survey of another culture, but rather to provide elements in order to convey images of a certain culture and, as such, provide material for self-definition. On the same perspective, Nida (1964:167) confirms that "no translation that attempts to bridge a wide cultural gap can help to eliminate all traces of the foreign setting".

For both texts, the translators make a shift from the direct reference in the ST into an indirect one in the TT by generalizing the term and using *instrument* and *storybook hero* respectively. This is done because what is clearly known and understood in one culture might be not in the

other so to maintain the readers' understanding, the translator makes this generalization.

2. "Translation by a more neutral/less expressive word":

This is another strategy in the semantic field of structure; it deals with differences in expressive meaning.

The Arabic Text:

٣- فلنشكر الله بكرة وأصيلا، آناء الليل وأطراف النهار، وما أتفه شكرنا حيال هذه النعم الربيانية." (محفوظ، زقاق المدق، ١٩٧٣: ٩)

٤- "على خدمتنا كالنحلة تقوم." (محفوظ، ميرامار، ١٩٦٧: ٤١)

English Translation:

- Let us therefore thank God *day and night*. How insignificant our thanks are in the face of these divine blessings." (Mahfouz, Midaq Alley, 1992:8)

- "Zuhra waited on us, **moving slightly**" (Mahfouz, Miramar, 1978:30)

Back Translation:

- فلنشكر الله في النهار والليل. وما أصغر شكرنا هذا أمام تلك النعم الربيانية.
- كانت تخدمنا زهرة بهدوء.

For the first example, the speaker's utterance is heavily loaded with Quranic indications "بكرة وأصيلا، آناء الليل وأطراف النهار". However, the translator uses TL neutral expressions "Day and night" and deletes the other portion of the text "بكرة وأصيلا" for the sake of the readership. This is a case where "there is ordinarily no full equivalence between code-units" (Maasoum & Davtalab 2011: 23). However, the result is a translation that lacks the religious implications of the ST.

As for the second example, the ST carries simile to explain how the character (Zohra) used to serve them actively. Translating (كالنحلة) into (moving slightly) doesn't convey the SL meaning and it was less emotive.

Translating these cultural expressions with neutral or less expressive expressions in the TT shows that a direct matching of the original function of the ST is not possible in this case due to the unique status that the ST has in the source culture. Any translation in order to be adequate should have a function equivalent to the function of its ST. (House, 1997:74-75, 2015:66).

3. "Translation by cultural substitution":

This procedure includes replacing a culture-specific expression with a target language one which does not have the same propositional meaning taking into consideration its effect on the target reader. The most remarkable feature of this procedure is that it makes the TL reader comprehend and understand the translated text.

The following example could well clarify our point of view in this regard:

The Arabic Text:

- "فأنكفأ وجه الرجل و أصفر غضبا." (محفوظ، زقاق المدق ، ١٩٧٣ : ١٣٥)

- "لنشرب الشربات _ تعالي." (محفوظ، اللص والكلاب، ١٩٦١ : ٩)

English Translation:

- "Alwan's face fell and he turned **red** with rage." (Mahfouz, 1992:138)

- "Come to the shop to have a **cold drink** to celebrate." (Mahfouz, The Thief and the dogs, 1984:16)

Back Translation:

-وانقلب وجه الرجل وأشدت غضبه.

-تعالى الى الدكان نحتفل ونحتسى شرابا منعشا.

Since the two cultures share the same concept of rage, the translator opts for what Eco mentions: "A good translation then is not countered with the denotation but with its connotation of words and it must generate the same effect aimed at by the original" (Eco,2000:8).

The two translators make a cultural substitution "أصفر" is rendered as "red" and "شربات" as "cold drink"

4. "Translation using a loan word or loan word plus explanation":

This strategy is specially used in dealing with culture-specific items, modern concepts, and buzz words. The use of the loan word with an explanation is very useful when the word is repeated several times in the text. Once the loan word is indicated by the explanation, the loan word can then be used by its own.

The Arabic Text:

- "ولا يعيبيها أن تروح عن نفسها بالمشي في الموسكي." (محفوظ، زقاق المدق، ١٩٧٣:

٣٨)

- "وأبي كان عمدة." (محفوظ، اللص والكلاب، ١٩٦١: ١١٦)

English Translation:

- "There's not wrong with her strolling occasionally along **the Mousky**"

(Mahfouz, Midaq Alley, 1992:37)

- "My father was the **Umda, the village headman.**" (Mahfouz, The Thief and the Dogs, 1984:126)

Back Translation:

-وما من امر خاطئ بالنسبة لها اذا تجولت في الموسكي.

-وكان ابي عمدة، رئيس القرية.

“Mousky” is a very well-known area and street in Cairo and it is rendered by transliteration because it is considered as a proper noun. As for the Arabic lexical item "العمدة" it means the head of the village, the man who is supposed to be highly respected by the villagers and his orders are to be followed by all inhabitants of the village. This expression is very common in Egypt. Mahfouz is well-known for using colloquial expressions in his novels to convey the unique image of Egyptian life. The translator doesn't translate it as “ **mayor** ” to maintain the uniqueness of this expression and tries to use it as a loan expression "**Umda**" and adding to the TL reader some other explanation using “the **village headman**” in order to remove any vagueness for the readership.

5. “Translation by paraphrase using a related word”:

This strategy tends to be used when the source item is lexicalized in the target item but in a different form, and when the frequency of a certain form is used in the source text is markedly higher than would be natural in the target language.

The Arabic Text:

-كان يحرص دائما الا يفوته يوم من حياته دون صنع جميل أو ينقلب الى بيته ملوما

محسورا. (محفوظ، زقاق المدق، ١١: ١٩٧٣)

- تلك المرأة النابطة في طينة ننتة اسمها الخيانة" (محفوظ، ميرامار، ١٩٦٧: ٨)

The English Translation:

-“ He had taken care that not a single day should pass without doing some good deed or receiving in his home some abused or **unfortunate person.**” (Mahfouz, Midaq Alley, 1992;8)

-“ that woman who sprang from **filth, from vermin, from treachery and infidelity**” (Mahfouz, Miramar,1984:14).

Back Translation:

-وقد حرص ان لايفوت يوما من دون ان يعمل شيئا مفرحا او ان لا يعود لبيته شخصا مهموما.

- تلك المرأة قد جاءت من أصل قدر وموؤذ وخائن غير مخلص.

The Arabic expressions “ملوما محسورا” has religious connotation since it is mentioned in the Glorious Quran. And since this concept is not familiar for the TT reader , it is to paraphrased as “**unfortunate person**”. A for “طينة نتنة” the translator also opts to paraphrase it by many TL expressions in order to convey the same effect for the readership in TL.

6. “Translation by paraphrase using unrelated words”:

This strategy can be used when the concept in the source item is not lexicalized in the target language. Instead of a related word, the paraphrase may be based on modifying a superordinate or simply on clarifying the meaning of the source item. The main advantage of the paraphrase strategy is that it achieves a high level of precision in specifying propositional meaning.

The Arabic Text:

-“ولكن قلوبهم رقصت جذلا ومنوا أنفسهم برؤية منظر بهيج مسل”. (محفوظ، زقاق المدق،

(١٩٧٣ : ١٠٦)

-“كانت تقف كمدن غير قابل للكسر”. (محفوظ، ميرانمار، ١٩٦٧ : ١١٩)

English Translation:

-“They **thoroughly enjoyed** witnessing such a dramatic scene“(Mahfouz, Midaq Alley, 1992;105)

-“She stood there **full of confidence.**” (Mahfouz, Miramar, 1978:97)

Back Translation:

-وقد استمتعوا كثيرا بمشاهدة هكذا مشهد مؤثر .

-وقفت هناك بثقة تامة .

"رقصت قلوبهم جذلا" has a very deep cultural indication. It is used here to explain the high status of enjoyment for some characters in the novel. As for "كمدن غير قابل للكسر" it explains firmness and steadiness of the character. The far-distance between the two languages necessitates the translators to violate the original's function and operate with a different level of function in the ST to create a similar meaning in the TT.

7. “Translation by omission”:

This technique involves omit translating an expression in some contexts. When the meaning conveyed by certain expression is not essential for understanding the translation, translator often uses this strategy to avoid detailed clarification of the SL message in the TL. The following example clarifies this technique:

The Arabic Text:

"طاهر النية وسيدنا الحسين. لا تسرعى هكذا يا حميدة!"(محفوظ، زقاق المدق، ١٩٧٣:

٣٨).

- "أن أعمل كمأذون شرعي رسالته في الحياة أن يوفق بين الشرق والغرب في الحلال."

(محفوظ،ميرامار، ١٩٦٧: ٤٥)

English Translation:

- "My intentions are completely pure. Don't rush off Hamida!"(Mahfouz, Midaq Alley,1992:31).

-"I sought a compromise, a marriage of East and West." (Mahfouz, Miramar,1978:31).

Back Translation:

-ان نوايايا خالصة ..لا تسرعى يا حميدة.

-أسعى الى التسوية، زواج يجمع الشرق بالغرب.

Swearing by inserting "الحسين" or other expressions such as "دم الحسين"

is a familiar and general tradition for Egyptians, they identify the religious orientation of the Egyptian everyday routine because Al-Hussein Temple lies in Egypt. However, this conception has been denied by the translator and eventually omitted in translation since it is unique to the readership.

For the second example the position of "مأذون شرعي" is quite familiar for the Arabic reader while it is not for the TT readers. In this case what is casual or comprehended for the Arabic reader might not be for the English one and since they are alien to the TL readers, the translator omits them altogether. This strategy is used because the original text

has a well-marked linguistic relativity. These Arabic expressions have a great influence on its speakers' thinking, behavior and representation. Any verbalization strategy in translating them could lead to serious shortcomings for TL readers.

8. "Translation by illustration":

This strategy can be a useful choice when the lexical item which lacks an equivalent in the target language (or does not cover some shades of the source item meaning) refers to a physical entity which can be illustrated, especially in order to avoid lengthy explanation and the text remains concise and to the point.

The Arabic Text:

- "وكان يتناول غداءه في حجرة أنيقة أعد بها فراشا للمقيل. وكان غداؤه يتكون عادة من

خضر وبطاطس وصينية فريك." (محفوظ، زقاق المدق، ١٩٧٣: ٥٨)

- "وخرجت تحمل دقيق العيد" (محفوظ، اللص والكلاب، ١٩٦١: ٨)

English Translation:- "It was Alwan's custom to have his lunch in a pleasant room that contained a couch of his subsequent afternoon siesta. His lunch generally consisted of vegetables, potatoes and **a bowl of husked green wheata bowl of cooked green wheat.**" (Mahfouz, Midaq Alley, 1992:45)

- "She came carrying home flour to make sweet meats for the feast."

(Mahfouz, The Thief and the Dogs, 1984:15)

Back Translation:

- وكان السيد علوان يتناول غداؤه عادة في غرفة مريحة فيها اريكة لقيولة الظهرية. وكان

غداؤه عبارة عن خضار وبطاطس وزيدية من القمح الاخضر المقشر... وهو الحنطة الخضراء

المطبوخة.

- وخرجت تحمل الدقيق لتصنع منه حلويات العيد.

These examples reflect the Egyptian culture where a multitude of individual mental representations exist. The public use of "صينية فريك" and "دقيق العيد" convey very specific cultural expressions which don't have equivalences in the TL culture. Thus, the translator opts for illustrating this type of dish by referring to its ingredients in English in an attempt to fill such a gap and to create a familiar reference for the readership. However, with reference to first example, the spectrum between the ST & TT is very far and meaning loss in TT is very evident.

5-Conclusion:

This study has focused on the applicability of Baker's (1992) taxonomy of the translation strategies in translating Arabic narrative discourse. This study shows that most of the translation strategies adopted are pertinent since the TT conveys the linguistic and cultural information for the readership.

It is worthy to note that translation by a more general expression causes a distortion of the message intended in the source text, the resulted translation thus was unjust to the SL and loss of meaning is evident. Such a strategy could be used when there is no equivalence in the TL. The gap-fillings conducted by translators in using the translation by using loan words don't guarantee the intercultural understanding. They can be considered appropriate only when it helps to maintain the underlying textual intention of the original source

References:

- ❖ Baker, M. (1992). *In Other Words: A Coursebook on Translation*. London and New York: Routledge. Brill
- ❖ Bassnett, S., & Lefevere, A. (1998). *Constructing Cultures: Essays on Literary Translation*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- ❖ Carbonell, O. (1994) " *The Exotic Space of Cultural Translation*". In: R. Alvarez and Vidal, C. (eds) **Translation, Power, Subversion**. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters. pp.79-98
- ❖ Eco, U. 2000 **Experiences in translation**. Toronto: Toronto University Press.
- ❖ Faiq, Said, (2004) " *Cultural encounters in Translation From Arabic*" In: Said Faiq(ed) **Cultural Encounters In Translation From Arabic**, Clevedon: Multilingual Matters LTD, pp:1-13
- ❖ House, J. (1997) **Translation Quality Assessment: A Model Revisited**, Tübingen: Gunter Narr.
- ❖ _____ (2015) **Translation Quality Assessment: Past and Present**, London: Routledge.
- ❖ Mahfouz, N. (1973). *Zuqaq-Al-Midaq*. The Library of Egypt. Cairo.
- ❖ Mahfouz, N. (1961). *The Thief and the Dogs*. Cairo: The Library of Egypt.
- ❖ Mahfouz, N. (1967). *Miramar*. Cairo: The Library of Egypt.
- ❖ Mahfouz, N. (1978). *Miramar*. Translated by Fatma Moussa Mahmoud.
- ❖ (1978). Cairo: The American University Press.
- ❖ Mahfouz, N. (1992). *Midaq Alley*. Translated by Trevor Le Gassick. London: Heinemann.
- ❖ Mahfouz, N. (1984). **The Thief and the Dogs**. Translated by Trevor Le Gassick and M. M. Badawi. Cairo: The American University Press.

- ❖ Maasoum, S. M. H., & Davtalab, H. (2011). An Analysis of Culture-Specific Items in the Persian Translation of "Dubliners" Based on Newmark's Model. *Theory & Practice in Language Studies*, 1(12).
- ❖ Nida, E. A. (1964) **Toward a Science of Translating: with Special Reference to Principles and Procedures Involved in Bible Translating**. Leiden: E.J. Brill
- ❖ Van Leeuwen, R. (2004) "*Cultural Context of Translating Arabic Literature*" In: Said Faiq (ed) **Cultural Encounters In Translation From Arabic**, Clevedon: Multilingual Matters LTD, pp:14-25