

And I have grown quite decrepit from old age?
Abdulla Y. Ali, *Translation of the Meanings of the Holy Quran*,
Vol. I (Beirut: Printing Production, 1946), p. 788.

(22) Instead of the Classical *سبح* one could suggest *نقى* or *أمضى* which would not violate any of Hemingway's rules of simple and direct writing.

(23) Leean Short, *Style in Fiction*, p. 188

الأسلوب في الترجمة

ملخص

د . عدنان خالد عبد الله

هناك تعاريف عديدة ترتبط بصطلح الاسلوب ومنها انه الرداء السبذي ترتديه الفكرة أو أنه الزخرف الذي يجعل فكرة معينة أو أنه انحراف عن المعيارية . وقد يعده البعض رؤيا الكاتب التي تعبر عن نفسها في اختياراته اللغوية . فالاسلوب بالمعنى الأخير يحتل مكانة رفيعة في الأدب الحد يست وخصوصاً عندما يستخدمه الكاتب كوسيلة للتعبير عن رؤيته الفردية إلى العالم . والمترجم الذي يخفق في ادراك اهمية هذه النظرة إلى الاسلوب يخفق في عرض وجهة نظر الكاتب ومن ثم يشوه رؤياه .

ويعرض الباحث امثلة عديدة من لغات مختلفة على هذا التشويه مثبتاً بأنه يؤدي إلى عرض وجهة نظر مغايرة للكاتب . وقد يصل ذلك التشويه والتحريف إلى طمس معالم الشهرة التي يتمتع بها الكاتب في لغته الأصلية لأن تمييزه الأسلوبي لا يظهر من خلال تلك الترجمة غير الدقيقة .

Australia ; the English quotation is taken from Jock Marshall and Russell Drysdale, *Journey among Men* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1962), p. 126, as quoted by Horst Ruthrof, *The Reader's Construction of Narrative* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1981), pp. 189-190.

- (14) The term 'mind style' which is coined by Roger Fowler, may "refer to any distinctive linguistic presentation of an individual mental self". See Roger Fowler, *Linguistics and Novel* (London: Methuen, 1977), p. 103.
- (15) Geoffrey N. Leech and Michael H. Short, *Style in Fiction: A Linguistic Introduction to English Fictional Prose* (London: Longman, 1981), p. 206. See also the extended stylistic analysis on pp. 202-207.
- (16) There have been a few exceptions, such as Hayden Carruth who questions the validity of the translation of the murder episode in his *After The Stranger: Imaginary Dialogues with Camus* (N.Y.: Macmillan, 1965), pp. 38-41 and John E. Gale, "Does America know *The Stranger*? A Reappraisal of a Translation," *Modern Fiction Studies*, Vol. 2, No. 2 (Summer, 1974), pp. 139-147.
- (17) Gale, p. 155.
- (18) C.P. Heaton, "Style in *The Old Man and the Sea*" *Style*, IV (1976), pp. 11, and Harry Levin, "From Observations on the Style of Ernest Hemingway" in *Essays in Stylistic Analysis*, ed. Howard S. Eabb (N.Y.: Harcourt, Brace, Jovanovich, 1971), p. 323, and Larry W. Phillips, *Ernest Hemingway on Writing* (London: Granada, 1984), pp. 27 & 30.
- (19) Wayne C. Booth, *The Rhetoric of fiction* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1961), pp. 211-242.
- (20) Levin, pp. 329-333.
- (21) Marmaduke Pickthall, *The Meaning of the Glorious Koran* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1939), p. 369. Compare the following translations of the sentence *وقد بلغت من الكبر عتياً* and I am now arrived at a great age, and am decrepit? George Sale, *The Koran* (London: Frederick Warne [1734], n.d), p. 297.and I have attained to the declining of old age?" A.J. Arberry, *The Koran Interpreted* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1955), p. 330.

ational symposia also included useful discussions of basic concepts associated with style. See Thomas Sebeok, ed. *Style in Language* (Mass.: The M.I.T. Press, 1960), and Seymour Chatman, ed. *Literary Style: A Symposium* (N.Y.: Oxford Univ. Press, 1971).

- (2) See, for instance, J.M. Murry, *The Problem of Style* (London: Oxford Univ. Press, 1960), pp. 4-5.
- (3) C.F. Hockett, *A Course in Modern Linguistics* (New York: Macmillan, 1958), p. 556.
- (4) The most representative essay in this regard comes from the Prague school member Jan Mukarovsky "Standard Language and Poetic Language," in Paul L. Garvin, ed. *A Prague School Reader on Esthetics, Literary Structure, and Style* (Washington: Georgetown Univ. Press, 1964), pp. 17-30.
- (5) Le style... est une question non de technique mais de vision," Marcel Proust, *Le Temps Retrouvé: A la Recherche du Temps Perdu* vol. III (Paris: Pleiade ed., 1909), p. 895.
- (6) For a poststructuralist reading of Longinus' treatise, see Suzanne Guerlac, "Longinus and the Subject of the Sublime" in *New Literary History*, vol. XVI, Winter 1985, Number 2, pp. 275-289.
- (7) J. Catford, *A Linguistic Theory of Translation* (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1965), p. 1.
- (8) Roman Jakobson, "On linguistic Aspects of Translation" in *Language in Literature*, ed: Krystyna Pomorska and Stephen Rudy (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ. Press, 1987), p. 429.
- (9) George Steiner, *After Babel: Aspects of Language and Translation* (N.Y.: Oxford Univ. Press, 1975), p. 260.
- (10) Elsa Gress, "The Art of Translating" in *The World of Translation*, n.a. (N.Y.: P.E.N. American Center, 1971), p. 61; Peter Newmark, *Approaches to Translation* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1988), p. 121; and Edward Sapir, *Language* (London: Harvest Books, 1949), p. 222.
- (11) *Language of Fiction: Essays in Criticism & Verbal Analysis of the English Novel* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1966), p. 23.
- (12) H.G. Widdowson, *Stylistics and the Teaching of Literature* (London: Longman, 1975), pp. 31, 81.
- (13) The excerpts are taken from a Ph.D thesis by Stephen Muecka (SM) in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Western

slator presented Hemingway to his Arab readers as a writer who is quite relaxed in his prose, prone religious allusions, and given to abstractions. In other words, the Hemingway who had established his literary career as a master of objective, naked and razor-sharp style is being represented as a writer who is fond of subjectivity, religious allusions, and verbal redundancy. What this entails is that the translation has presented an ideologically different view of Hemingway, because the translator has failed to grasp the import of Hemingway's style. It is no wonder that a translator who betrays a writer in the very essence of his literary fame should, even in that opening sentence of the novella, commit an elementary geographical error by translating "Gulf Stream" as a gulf!

Excerpt B represents a closer translation to the original than excerpt A. The only notable problem is the use of the verb "سَلَخَ" which suggests grand style or classical Arabic (22). And any allusion to grand style violates a basic component of Hemingway's style. Otherwise, excerpt B comes very close to the original even in the number of words: The opening sentence of *The Old Man and the Sea* contains 27 words; excerpt B contains a surprising 27 words; whereas in excerpt A the translation has been stretched to 37 words.

A basic problem in literary translation is the absence of a terminologically viable theory which would account for differences in meaning, style, tone, and flavor between different translations of the same text. To merely emphasize faithfulness as opposed to unfaithfulness or accuracy as opposed to inaccuracy seems to beg the question. In literary translation primacy should be given to the style of the writer or the world view embodied in the work, which finds its expression in the way the writer employs language. A successful translation is one which takes account of the uniqueness of the style of the author as it is expressed in his particular language, because no writing can ever be neutral or objective, since every "writer slants towards a particular mental set" (23), and expresses certain presuppositions whether literary, aesthetic, or 'cultural.

The failure of the translator to grasp these variables entails presenting a different set of values and ideologies from the ones intended by the author.

Notes

- (1) For a clear discussion of the different meanings of "style" in modern linguistics, see N.E. Enkvist, J. Spencer and M.J. Gregory, *Linguistics and Style* (London: Oxford Univ. Press, 1967), pp. 23. Two intern-

كان رجلاً عجوزاً يصيد السمك وحده في قارب عريض القمر في تيار الخليج ، وكان قد سلخ أربعة وثمانين يوماً من غير أن يفوز بسمكة واحدة .
 انرست هيمنغواي ، الشيخ والبحر ، ترجمة منير العبدليكي (بيروت : دار العلم للملايين ، ١٩٧٨) ، ص ٧ .

The opening sentence of *The Old man and the Sea* introduces the reader to the tone of the novella, a one which is objective, downbeat, and a little bit ironic, which gives the old man's painful experiences a heroic touch. The first sentence is striking in the simplicity of its individual words, a feature which dominates the novella. (18) Characteristic of Hemingway's style is his insistence on *showing* rather than *telling*: the reader should reach his own conclusions rather than receive them ready-made from the novelist.(19) Another feature of Hemingway's style which has been observed by some of his sensitive critics is the avoidance of abstraction and the preference for the concrete, since the latter offers reality without comment (20) .

Excerpt A opens with a sentence which is a quotation from the Koran. Zcharia, who is addressing God, is surprised for being told that he would beget a son:

He said : My Lord! How can I have a son when my wife is barren and I have reached infirm old age! (21) .

«قال رب اني يكون لي غلام وكانت امرأتي عاقراً وقد بلغت من التمر عتياً»
 The translator adopts the last sentence (i.e., "I have reached infirm old age) with its grand eloquence in Arabic for the direct, simple, and monosyllabic "old man".

The choice of the Koranic phrasing and its connotation would have been appropriate were it not for the fact that it opposes Hemingway's conviction of simple, direct, and secular style. The translator has also added a whole sentence backtranslated as "but he is still crouching alone in his boat": Not only is the sentence redundant and superfluous but it also adds an element of sentimental suspense since the old man is compared to an animal waiting for a prey. The last sentence, backtranslated as "The sea has not endowed him with any sustenance" is too general and abstract, and thus violates Hemingway's preference for the concrete over the abstract (*fish* rather than *sustenance*). The translator has not merely committed a few mistakes here and there, or has added a new sentence to the original, but what is more important and far more serious is that the tran-

The extract comes from Camus's famous novella *L'Étranger*, which, upon its appearance, was immediately met with such enthusiasm and praise that the translation was not challenged by another translation, nor was its accuracy questioned. (16).

Camus's style in the novella expresses an existential conviction of straightforwardness and clarity. The protagonist, Meursault, always opts for clear-cut choices, avoids hesitation and vacillation, and his language is described as "direct ..., laconic, and stripped of structural complexity." (17)

If we examine the French quotation, we find that the text consists of a simple sentence coordinated by the conjunction *et*, the two actions are independent of each other, "Je pourrai veiller" and "Je rentrerai"; whereas in the English version both actions depend on the verb *can*, and thus the structure of the sentence is complicated and consequently the translation conveys a world view of a character diametrically opposed to that of the French version. Moreover, the verb *veiller* which means "keep the wake" has been unduly expanded to "spend the night there, keeping the usual vigil beside the body." The one's and terse three-word French has become a thirteen-word long English sentence. A similar expansion of a simple sentence occurs when Meursault is asked about Paris, and he answers "*C'est sale*," (p. 70) which appears in English as "A dingy sort of town, to my mind," (p. 51). Meursault's choices are either positive or negative, but the English version shows him as vacillating, apologetic, and wordy, and hence the world view of this character is compromised.

4- He was an old man who fished alone in a skiff in the Gulf Stream and he had gone eighty-four days now without taking a fish.
Ernest Hemingway, *The Old Man and the Sea* (London: Jonathan Cape, 1952), p. 5.

كان الرجل قد بلغ من العمر عتياً...
ولكنه لا يزال رابضاً في زورقه، وحيداً، يطلب الصيد في خليج «جواد
ستريم» وقد عبرت به حتى الساعة اربعة وثمانون يوماً لم يجد عليه البحر خلاصاً
بشيء من الرزق.

ارنست همنغواي، العجوز والبحر، ترجمة صالح جودت (بيروت:
المكتبة الحديثة للطباعة والنشر، ب.ت)، ص ١٢.

The translation succeeds in conveying the simplicity of Benji's vocabulary but fails to take account of his generalization and inexactness. The second sentence, "they were coming toward where the flag was" is rendered as كانوا يقتربون من العلم which can be backtranslated as.

"They were approaching the flag." Benji's sentence reveals a "mind style" which works with approximations, with visual memory, and with things as he imagines them rather than things as they are. (14) The translation suggests something else: it shows Benji as a person whose mind works with exact locations and things. The original sentence shows that in Benji's world "primacy seems to be given to the visual field in which objects reside rather than the objects themselves." (15)

The second infelicity appears in the third sentence, "Luster was hunting in the grass by the flower tree" translated as كان لستر يبحث في العشب قرب شجرة الورد backtranslated as "Luster was searching in the grass near the flower tree." The difference between the two versions lies in the verb chosen: Benji's "hunt" reveals a basic misunderstanding not only of the game but also of causality, that is, the movements of the players and the course of the game are beyond his comprehension, and the whole game has been reduced to a very primitive game, that is of hunt and hunting*. Also for Benji the absence of causality, and his inability to understand the intricacies of the game imposes severe limitations on his view of the world because Benji haunts the golf course simply to hear his sister's name, "Caddy," being often called as "Caddie." Benji's world is simple, primitive, and lacks coherence. The translation fails to show this and hence misrepresents the idiot's conception of the world by normalizing his deviant vocabulary, and his deviant world.

3- *Ainsi, Je Pourrai veiller et je rentrerai demain soir.* Albert Camus. *L'Étranger* (Paris: Gallimard, 1957), p. 9.

"Then I can spend the night there, keeping the usual vigil beside the body, and be back by tomorrow evening."

Albert Camus, *The Outsider* trans. Stuart Gilbert (London: Heinemann, 1971), p. 11.

* For a normal human being of average intelligence, "hunt" and "search" should mean nearly the same thing; for Benji, "search" would represent an abstraction beyond his mental capacity. Moreover, the verb "hunt" conforms to Benji's practice of substituting 'common core' terms for technical ones (eg., table for *tee*). See Note No 15, p. 204.

then he finished them ...
 but we was still frightened of him you
 know (laughs)
 (SM: they killed him in the end didn't they?)
 yeah killed him after (from transcript of orally presented
 tale (13)

Obviously, the English text represents the white man's understanding of the Aboriginal world and the sequence of events, as represented by the "civilizing" rendition of the story from Pidgin English. The English version is prosaic, matter-of-fact, and logical. It ends with the white man's supremacy over the natives, whereas the Pidgin version is dramatic, intense, and is intended to show the Aboriginal as a hunter and a survivor. The differences between the two texts represent differences in styles. The same event which is viewed by the English as a violation of law, is considered a heroic deed by the Aboriginals. The difference in style has entailed a different world because the English version "breathes peace and serenity," whereas the Aboriginal suggests bellicosity, defiance, and violence. In short, the translation fails because it misrepresents the Aboriginal world and reflects a different culture and a different attitude.

2- Through the fence, between the curling flower spaces,
 I could see them hitting. They were coming toward where
 the flag was and I went along the fence. Luster was
 hunting in the grass by the flower tree.
 William Faulkner, *The Sound and the Fury* (N.Y. : Alfred A.
 Knopf, 1929), p. 1.

من خلال السياج : بين فسحات الزهور المثلثية كنت اراهم يضربون .
 كانوا يقتربون من العلم ومشيت أنا بمحاذاة السياج . كان لستر
 يبحث في العشب قرب شجرة الورد .
 وليم فوكنر ، الصخب والعنف ترجمة جبرا ابراهيم جبرا (بيروت : دار
 الآداب : ١٩٧٩) . ص ٤٧ .

The opening sentences of William Faulkner's *The Sound and the Fury* show how scenes and events are filtered through Benji Compson's mind, the thirty-three year old idiot who is observing a game of golf. His description reveals a style which betrays a world view that can be described as childish, visual, and extremely limited.

ively few volunteers. Worse, other aborigines who were smart under injustices inflicted by Pigeon (concerned, as usual, with women joined the whites. Soon, however, Pigeon, Captain and Ellemara ambushed and slaughtered two more white men in Winjana Gorge. These were Burke and Gibbs, who confident in their long friendship with the local tribes, had refused to arm themselves even after hearing of the death of Richardson.

Today this country breathes peace and serenity. (From *Journey among Men*)

Now compare the previous narrative with the following Aboriginal material based on a recording of the same events:

alright he took all the ammunition
take-im down the cave.
put it all his ammunition there, guns and all.
he might a been train (laughs)
oh yes he was still fighting.
oh no chance. he was keep fighting.
Pigeon was still fighting.
he had a ostrich inside his paddock (laughs)
he had his lil' paddock you know.
you know and er Pigeon home.
oh he was a real bushman that fella. real
real bushman.
used to be on a mountain.
they can't hardly find 'cos they can't see-im.
he's having the leaves front him and all the
long leaf an' he right behind the leaf.
used to be in the rock you know (SM :men)
had a few trick that fella (laughs)
(SM: How'd he finish up?)
eh?
(SM: How'd he finish up?)
he was finished ah un ah ...
that was good while he keep that fighting
goin'
till um places were getting more bigger
and bigger see ?

misrepresentation(12.) But these appellations are not just impressionistic and fail to show where the translation has not been successful or how the loss affects the way the reader responds to the work, but they essentially point to a basic weakness in translation practice. Sometimes, especially in modern literature where style assumes supreme importance, the author deliberately expresses his mode of existence or his vision in a style unique to that vision. Modern literature becomes even more problematic when texts noted for their stylistic subtlety are translated into different languages or cultures. The author's particular mode of vision is severely compromised when translated into a different culture and the translated version becomes a text with a different effect, a different meaning. Let us examine some narrative texts and see how the translator's failure to capture the style involves a distortion of the text, a misrepresentation of the author, and a compromise of his vision.

1- The first example comes from an Australian Aboriginal oral narrative, and the same material "translated" into English narrative, and can be called intralingual translation, if we adopt Jakobson's terms. It is the story of an Aboriginal outlaw, Pigeon, who tried to enlist the natives to fight the whites:

[Tunnel Creek] was once the hiding-place, and the last ditch stand, of Sandemara, also called Pigeon. In one way, Pigeon was a kind of black William Wallace. He tried to drive the white invader from the land.

Pigeon was a 'black-tracker' in the employ of the Western Australian police in the 'nineties of the last century. On patrol with Constable Richardson he personally captured the notorious Ellemara, a tribal outlaw and cattle spearer of the Kimberleys. But before Pigeon got Ellemara back to Richardson's camp, the captive had persuaded him that black should not be in league with white, and that Pigeon should join Ellemara in a struggle against all Europeans. That night, Pigeon, and another tracker, pactain, murdered the sleeping Richardson. They liberated the prisoners and took to the bush with the guns and ammunition that the white men had taught them to use. They hoped that every aboriginal in the territory would join the movement, and that the white man would be crased from the landscape.

Of course it did not happen that way. By and large, the white men who settled in the area had treated the natives fairly. Pigeon found relat-

Roman Jakobson has suggested three types of translation—rewording, translation proper, and transmutation:

(1) Intralingual translation or *rewording* is an interpretation of verbal signs by means of other signs of the same language. (2) Interlingual translation or *translation proper* is an interpretation of verbal signs by means of signs of some other language. (3) Intersubstitutive translation or *transmutation* is an interpretation of verbal signs by means of signs of non-verbal systems. (8)

Rewording is used within the same language when, for instance, a poem is paraphrased into a piece of prose. *Translation proper* is the interpretation of verbal signs from one language into the verbal signs of another. *Transmutation* is the interpretation of verbal signs by non-verbal signs (such as a ballet version of a play, or a poem based on a painting). Drawing on Pierce's semiotic theory and expanding Jakobson's observation, Steiner offers the following cryptic definition: "Translation... is the perpetual, inescapable condition of signification. (9)"

If we combine the concept of *style* as the writer's individual vision which finds its best expression in his verbal signs and *translation* as the interpretation of those verbal signs from a source language (SL) by means of other verbal signs into a target language (TL), we have narrowed down the signification of these terms. Unfortunately, however, no act of translation is done without considerable differences between the SL-version and the TL version. There is almost a unanimous agreement that those differences are due to "loss" in meaning, import, flavor, etc. Scholars have invariably attributed that loss to the inability of the translator to capture the "context" of the work, its "register", or the "matrix" of the language (10.) That loss has been called "unfaithfulness", "inadequacy," or "infidelity." David Lodge, for instance, says:

The loss is felt not on the level of 'mere sense' but in the higher categories of Richards's levels of meaning, or what is sometimes called, in modern linguistics, 'delicacy'. (11)

Another critic has gone so far as to claim that loss in translation entails

Style in Translation

Abstract

Adnan K. Abdulla, Ph.D.

Of the myriad definitions of style, the concept of a writer's vision of the world as it is expressed through his language is adopted in this paper. Translators who fail to take account of this view of style misrepresent the author and compromise his world view. Different examples from different languages are discussed from this perspective. The researcher affirms that in modern literature style assumes an important role in the writer's handling of the subject matter and style also becomes the vehicle through which the writer expresses his mode of existence. If a translator ignores the intricacies of a style, he ignores the essence of writer and consequently distorts his world view.

Style in Translation

The concept of style has been a subject of endless controversy, and what constitutes the essence of style is still hotly debated.(1) It is claimed, for instance, that style refers to that personal idiosyncrasy of expression by which we recognize a writer.(2) Others say that style is nothing but a matter of personal choice since a writer can deliberately change his choice of words, sentence lengths, adjectives, etc. according to his subject matter. Such a view is neatly expressed by a noted linguist who states that "two utterances in the same language which convey approximately the same information, but which are different in their linguistic structure, can be said to differ in style."(3) Still another group regards deviation from the norm as fundamental to any study of style.(4) Others agree with Proust that style is not a "matter of technique, but a mode of vision."(5) This view of style, although associated with modernism, is actually one of the oldest, and is the subject of Longinus' *On the Sublime* where style is not regarded as an embellishment, deviation, technique, or choice but as the highest achievement of literature where passages of elevated style "transport" the reader into a state of ecstasy or "exultation".(6) The conception of style which I will be using here refers to the writer's unique vision which finds its best expression in his peculiar linguistic preferences, choices, and eccentricities.

Translation is defined as an "operation performed on languages: a process of substituting a text in one language for text in another. (7)"